

Marc I. Machiz

Marc Machiz, a Partner at Cohen Milstein, joined the Firm in 2000 and is the head of the Employee Benefits (ERISA) practice group. He is the resident Partner of the Philadelphia office.

Mr. Machiz litigates ERISA class actions involving a range of benefits cases including inappropriate pension plan investments, the inappropriate investment in company stock by 401(k) plans, discharges to interfere with pension rights and illegal plan terminations including, among others, Hans v. Tharaldson et al.(D.N.D.) (purchase by ESOP of employer stock allegedly imprudently and for more than adequate consideration); Mehling, et al. v. New York Life Insurance Co., et al., (E.D. Pa.) (investment in allegedly overpriced mutual funds proprietary to the sponsor) and In re Williams Company ERISA Litigation (N.D. Okla) (investment by 401(k) plan in allegedly inflated company stock); In re Dynegy ERISA Litigation (S.D. Texas) (same); Simpson v. Firemen's Fund Insurance Co. (N.D. Cal.) (discharge of disabled employees allegedly to interfere with their attainment of health benefits); Stoeffels v. SBC Communications, Inc., (S.D. Texas).(termination of retiree telephone concession alleged to be a pension plan); Wagener v. SBC Communications Inc. Pension Plan (D.D.C.) (alleged failure to pay promised pension benefits); Zhu v. Fujitsu, N.D. Cal.(alleged vesting violation); Banyai v. Mazur (S.D.N,Y.) (alleged illegal transfer of fund assets). Mr. Machiz has submitted amicus curiae briefs to the Supreme Court and lower courts on behalf of the Pension Rights Center and the National Association of Insurance Commissioners. He consults with the AFL-CIO on state legislation to expand healthcare coverage so as to minimize the chance that such legislation will be held preempted, and he represents Fiduciary Counselors. Inc. in evaluating the adequacy of both ERISA and Securities settlements on behalf of plans participating in settlements with their plans sponsors and the officers of the plan sponsors, including evaluation of settlements in the the Enron Securities litigation.

He joined the Plan Benefits Security Division ("PBS") of the Office of the Solicitor of Labor as a trial attorney in 1978, and was appointed Assistant Counsel for Fiduciary Litigation in 1982. At the start of 1984, he joined Beins, Axelrod and Osborne, P.C. practicing general labor and ERISA law on behalf of unions and multiemployer plans. In 1986 he returned to the Department of Labor as Counsel for General Litigation at PBS, and from 1988 to 2000 held the position of Associate Solicitor, heading the Division. As Associate Solictor, Mr. Machiz was the Department of Labor's chief ERISA lawyer charged with responsibility for all enforcement litigation brought by the Secretary of Labor under the statute, which governs the vast majority of privately sponsored health, welfare and pension plans. He was also responsible for all legal advice under the statute provided to the Pension & Welfare Benefits Administration, which administers Title I of ERISA.

Mr. Machiz worked to institute the Department's innovative amicus program which aggressively advocated the Department's views throughout the judicial system on a wide range of ERISA issues ranging from the need to limit ERISA preemption of state worker and consumer protection laws to the need to strengthen participants' rights and remedies under the Act.

Mr. Machiz's expertise in ERISA has been recognized by his colleagues in the ERISA bar, who made him a Charter Fellow of the American College of Employee Benefits Counsel. Mr. Machiz



is a frequent speaker on ERISA issues for the ABA, ALI-ABAPLI, and private seminars, and has served as plaintiffs' co-chair of a subcommittees of the Employees Benefits Committee of the ABA's Labor Section. He is also a member of the BNA Pension and Benefits Reporter Advisory Board.

Mr. Machiz has authored several articles including *Understanding DOL's New Class Exemption* for the Release of Claims and Extensions of Credit in Connection with Litigation, Pension & Benefits Reporter, Vol. 31, No. 2, January, 2004; and ESOPS, ERISA, and Employer Stock: A Litigator's Approach, ATLA Commercial Litigation Section Newsletter, Volume 7, Number 3 (Spring/Summer 2001).

He attended the University of Pennsylvania, where he earned a B.A. in History, and received his law degree from the University of California at Berkeley (Boalt Hall) in 1978.

Mr. Machiz is admitted to practice in the District of Columbia and Pennsylvania.

Christine E. Webber

Christine Webber, a Partner at the Firm and a member of the Civil Rights & Employment Practice group, joined Cohen Milstein in 1997. She is the Partner in charge of the law clerk and summer associate program.

Ms. Webber represents plaintiffs in class action employment discrimination and Fair Labor Standards Act cases. Ms. Webber's current docket includes *Dukes v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.* (N.D. Cal.), a certified class action for over 1.6 million current and former female employees of Wal-Mart with complaints of discrimination in pay and promotion; *Hnot v. Willis* (S.D.N.Y.), representing a class of women at the vice-president level and above challenging sex discrimination in compensation and promotions; and *Jenkins v. BellSouth* (N.D. Ala.), representing a proposed class of African-American employees challenging race discrimination in promotions and compensation.

She represented plaintiffs in *Beck v. The Boeing Co.* (W.D. Wash.), a class action alleging sex discrimination in compensation and promotions which settled in 2004 for \$72.5 million. She was counsel in Trotter v. *Perdue* (D. Del.), representing plaintiffs who were wrongly denied payment of overtime wages, and obtaining a \$10 million settlement. She is also representing workers in a similar case against Tyson Foods, Inc.

In 2004, Ms. Webber was named one of the Top Lawyers in Washington, D.C. by *Washingtonian Magazine* and named as one of the 2007 Washington, D.C. *Superlawyers* in the Civil Rights category.

Prior to joining Cohen Milstein, Ms. Webber received a Women's Law and Public Policy fellowship and worked for four years at the Washington Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights and Urban Affairs in their Equal Employment Opportunity Project. She worked on a variety of employment discrimination cases, and focused in particular on the sexual harassment class action Neal v. Director, D.C. Department of Corrections, et al. Ms. Webber participated in the trial of this ground-breaking sexual harassment class action in 1995. Ms. Webber also tried the race

discrimination case *Cooper v. Paychex* (E.D. Va.), and successfully defended the plaintiffs' verdict before the Fourth Circuit.

Ms. Webber is a member of the National Employment Lawyers' Association (NELA) and cochair of their Class Action Committee. She speaks regularly at CLE programs on employment discrimination class actions, including presentations for NELA, and most recently participated in a panel on Evidentiary Issues and Jury Instructions in Employment Discrimination Litigation for ALI-ABA's program at Georgetown University Law Center in February 2007.

She graduated from Harvard University with a B.A. in Government (*magna cum laude*, 1988) and the University of Michigan Law School (J.D., *magna cum laude*, 1991, Order of the Coif). Following law school, Ms. Webber clerked for the Honorable Hubert L. Will, United States District Judge for the Northern District of Illinois.

Ms. Webber is admitted to practice in Illinois and the District of Columbia.

Richard A. Koffman

Richard Koffman, a Partner at the Firm, joined Cohen Milstein in 2003 and is a member of the Antitrust practice group. He is also a member of the firm's *Pro Bono* Committee.

He is currently serving as counsel for plaintiffs in, among other cases, *In re Rubber Chemicals Antitrust Litigation* (N.D. Ca.); *In re Polyester Staple Antitrust Litigation* (W.D.N.C.); and *In re Urethane Antitrust Litigation* (D. Kan.).

Mr. Koffman came to Cohen Milstein after four years as a senior trial attorney with the Antitrust and Civil Rights Divisions of the United States Department of Justice. Prior to joining the Department of Justice, he spent seven years in private practice, with Fine, Kaplan and Black in Philadelphia (working primarily on antitrust class actions and other complex commercial litigation) and then with Bernabei & Katz in Washington, D.C. (handling employment discrimination cases). While at Fine Kaplan, Mr. Koffman was actively involved in litigating several successful antitrust class actions on behalf of plaintiffs and classes, including *In re Nasdaq Market-Makers Antitrust Litigation* (S.D.N.Y.) (settled for more than \$1 billion); *In re Polypropylene Carpet Antitrust Litigation* (N.D. Ga.); *In re Commercial Explosives Antitrust Litigation* (D. Utah); and *In re Drill Bits Antitrust Litigation* (S.D. Tex.).

Immediately after law school, he served as a judicial clerk for Judge James B. McMillan of the Western District of North Carolina, and for Judge Anthony J. Scirica of the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit.

Mr. Koffman is the author of It's Not The First Time: Fudging the Truth in Discovery Proceedings Didn't Start with Clinton, Legal Times, August 24, 1998.

He is a graduate of Yale Law School (J.D., 1990), where he was a Senior Editor of the Law Journal, and Wesleyan University, from which he received a B.A., with honors, in English (1986).

Filed 10/19/2007

Mr. Koffman is admitted to practice in the District of Columbia.

Agnieszka M. Fryszman

Agnieszka Fryszman, a Partner at the Firm, joined Cohen Milstein in 1998 and is a member of the International Human Rights and Antitrust practice groups.

She currently represents Indonesian villagers in a lawsuit against Exxon Mobil over torture and extrajudicial killings allegedly committed by the defendant's security forces (a unit of the Indonesian military). For the past several years, she has represented the former "comfort women," women and girls who were forced into sexual slavery by the government of Japan during World War II. Her past successes include cases brought by survivors of Nazi-era forced and slave labor against the German and Austrian companies that allegedly used and profited from slave labor, which were resolved by international negotiations that resulted in multi-billion dollar settlements.

In the Antitrust practice group, she represents small businesses that have been victims of alleged price-fixing in the polyester staple and rubber chemicals markets.

She has represented, pro bono, a number of victims of the September 11 attack on the Pentagon and obtained significant recoveries, including one of the highest awards for an injured survivor, from the Victim's Compensation Fund. She also represents, pro bono, individuals indefinitely detained without charge by the United States at Guantanamo Bay.

Before joining the Firm, Ms. Fryszman was Democratic counsel to the United States House of Representatives Committee on the Judiciary, Subcommittee on Commercial and Administrative Law. She also served as counsel to Representative Henry Waxman, Ranking Member on the House Government Reform and Oversight Committee.

Ms. Fryszman graduated from Brown University with a B.A. in International Relations and Georgetown University Law Center (J.D., magna cum laude, 1996, Order of the Coif), where she was a Public Interest Law Scholar.

Ms. Fryszman is admitted to practice in the District of Columbia and New Jersey.

Charles E. Tompkins

Charles Tompkins, a Partner at Cohen Milstein, joined the Firm in 1999 and is a member of the Antitrust and Civil Rights & Employment practice groups, with an emphasis on obtaining redress on behalf of employees who have not been paid all of the wages they are owed.

In the antitrust field, Mr. Tompkins currently represents Registered Nurses employed by hospitals in Albany, Chicago, Detroit, Memphis, and San Antonio in lawsuits alleging that their employers unlawfully fixed their wages in violation of federal antitrust laws. Mr. Tompkins also is serving as a member of the co-lead counsel team in In Re Air Cargo Antitrust Litigation (E.D.N.Y.), a multi-billion dollar antitrust action alleging that the world's major cargo airlines

colluded in setting the amounts of various surcharges they imposed on their customers, and In Re Air Transportation Antitrust Litigation (N.D. Cal.), a federal antitrust action challenging a conspiracy among airlines to fix the amount of the fuel surcharge imposed on flights to and from Heathrow airport in London. Mr. Tompkins was a member of the trial team that, following a two-week jury trial, obtained a \$56.4 million judgment on behalf of Maine wild blueberry growers who alleged their suppliers fixed the prices of wild blueberries. Mr. Tompkins also was a member of the team that litigated the federal antitrust action Paper Systems, Inc. v. Mitsubishi Corp. et al. (E.D. Wisc.), which settled for \$20 million on the eve of trial.

In the employment field, Mr. Tompkins has represented a wide variety of employees, and twice obtained summary judgment on behalf of nationwide classes of Auto Damage Adjusters whose employer, GEICO, refused to pay them overtime. See Robinson-Smith v. GEICO (D.D.C.); Lindsay v. GEICO (D.D.C.). GEICO began paying overtime shortly after the adjusters' victory, and the United States Department of Labor has since cited Robinson-Smith in an official opinion letter. Mr. Tompkins also was part of the legal team that obtained a \$10 million settlement on behalf of chicken-processing workers who were not paid for the time they spent putting on and taking off their required safety equipment, Trotter v. Perdue Farms, Inc., et al. (D. Del.). Perdue Farms changed its practices as part of a global settlement and now pays its employees for this time. Mr. Tompkins also is a member of the team litigating Dukes v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. (N.D.Cal.), the largest certified Title VII class action in history, in which female employees of Wal-Mart seek redress for unfair gender discrimination, and Hnot v. Willis, et al. (S.D.N.Y.), in which a certified class of over one hundred female insurance brokerage executives allege sexual discrimination in compensation and promotions. Mr. Tompkins also serves, on a pro bono basis, as a consultant for the Immigrant and Refugee Rights Project at the Washington Lawyers Committee for Civil Rights And Urban Affairs, providing guidance and oversight in litigations brought on behalf of immigrant workers subject to wage and hour violations.

Mr. Tompkins has significant appellate appearance. He second-chaired the argument of Free v. Abbott Laboratories before the United States Supreme Court; briefed and successfully argued Lindsay v. GEICO before the United States Court of Appeals for the District Of Columbia Circuit; and briefed and argued Manchester v. Primerica Financial Services, et al., which was successfully settled prior to the issuance of a decision, before the United States Court of Appeals for the Eleventh Circuit.

Mr. Tompkins is the author of "Damages Issues in Fair Labor Standards Act Collective Action Litigation," which is scheduled to appear in Volume 10, Issue Number 2, of the Employee Rights and Employment Policy Journal of the Chicago-Kent School of Law; and the co-author, with Michael Hausfeld and Kalpana Kotagal, of "Innovation, Economics and the Law: The Health Care Industry's Exposure to Antitrust Liability," to be published by the ABA Antitrust Law Section in 2007. He has been asked on several occasions to lecture on employment law matters by both the American Bar Association and the National Employment Law Association.

Prior to joining Cohen Milstein, Mr. Tompkins was an associate with the Washington, D.C. office of Akin, Gump, Strauss, Hauer & Feld, L.L.P. He graduated magna cum laude from Colgate University and received his J.D. from the University of Virginia School of Law. He is licensed to practice in New York and the District of Columbia.



Julie Goldsmith Reiser

Julie Goldsmith Reiser, a Partner at the Firm, joined Cohen Milstein in 1999 and has specialized in complex litigation involving violations of the federal securities laws and employment discrimination.

Currently, she is working on Dukes v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. (N.D. Cal.) class action which has been certified for 1.5 million current and former female employees of Wal-Mart on complaints of discrimination in pay and promotion, and In re Parmalat Securities Litigation (S.D.N.Y.), a securities fraud class action alleging artificial inflation in the price of Parmalat's securities. She has also been involved in the litigation and successful settlement of Beck v. The Boeing Co. (W. D. Wash.), which alleged sex discrimination in compensation and promotions; In re P-Com Securities Litigation (N.D.Cal.) (\$16 million settlement); and In re Sabratek Securities Litigation (N.D.III.) (\$15.3 million settlement).

Ms. Reiser co-authored Companies in the Cross Hairs: When Plaintiffs Lawyers Choose Their Targets, They Look for These Employment Practices, The Legal Times, February 21, 2005. In 1999, she co-authored Antitrust Introduction for the General Practitioner, a chapter in the Washington Lawyer's Practice Manual.

Prior to joining Cohen Milstein, Ms. Reiser worked in Seattle, Washington where she focused primarily on guardianship and healthcare litigation. She was President of the Board of Directors of Seattle Works and chaired the Nominating Committee for the Board of Directors of the Eastside Domestic Violence Program. She also served a term as a Trustee for the Pacific Northwest Ballet. In 1997, Ms. Reiser worked as a Legal Intern for U.S. Senator Patty Murray.

Julie Reiser graduated from Vassar College (B.A. with honors 1992) and the University of Virginia Law School (J.D. 1997). While in law school, she was a member of the Virginia Journal of Law and Social Policy.

Ms. Reiser is admitted to practice in Washington State and the District of Columbia.

Victoria S. Nugent

Victoria Nugent, a Partner at the Firm, joined Cohen Milstein in 2000 and is a member of the Consumer Protection practice group.

Ms. Nugent has focused on consumer protection and public health litigation throughout her career, including In re StarLink Product Liability Litigation (N.D. Ill.), representing farmers who sued Aventis Cropscience after an unapproved variety of genetically modified corn was detected in the U.S. corn supply and drove down prices for all U.S. corn exports. More than \$100 million was recovered for the class in a landmark settlement. She is currently working on In re General Motors Dex-Cool Products Liability Litigation (S.D.Ill.), representing car owners seeking to enforce product warranties for an extended life coolant and Howell v. State Farm (D.Md.), representing flood policy holders who were denied the full benefits of their government-backed insurance policies following Hurricane Isabel. Ms. Nugent has argued cases before the high courts of Georgia, Nebraska and the District of Columbia, as well as the federal D.C. Circuit Court of Appeals.



Before joining Cohen Milstein, Ms. Nugent worked for seven years at Public Citizen, a national consumer advocacy organization. During that time, she worked on many legislative and regulatory campaigns addressing issues that ranged from automobile safety to international trade policy. In 1998, Ms. Nugent received a two-year fellowship sponsored by the National Association for Public Interest Law (NAPIL). As a NAPIL Fellow, she worked at Trial Lawyers for Public Justice (TLPJ), where she helped develop and prosecute impact litigation in the areas of arbitration, banking, credit and insurance.

Ms. Nugent received her undergraduate degree in History from Wesleyan University in 1991 and graduated from Georgetown University Law Center in 1998.

Ms. Nugent is admitted to practice in the District of Columbia and Maryland.

Benjamin D. Brown

Benjamin Brown, a Partner at the Firm, joined the firm in 2005 and is a member of the Antitrust practice group. He has extensive experience in complex litigation and class actions.

He is currently serving as counsel for plaintiffs in, among other cases, In re Aspartame Antitrust Litigation (E.D. Pa.); Brookshire Bros., Ltd., et al. v. Chiquita Brands Int'l., Inc., et al. (S.D. Fla.); In re Rubber Chemicals Antitrust Litigation (N.D. Ca.); In re Pressure Sensitive Labelstock Antitrust Litigation (M.D. Pa.); and John Boyd, et al. v. AWB Limited, et al. (S.D.N.Y.).

Mr. Brown came to Cohen Milstein after four years as a trial attorney with the Antitrust Division of the United States Department of Justice. While there, Mr. Brown led and assisted in numerous investigations, litigations and trials involving anticompetitive conduct and mergers. Mr. Brown also prosecuted criminal cases as a Special Assistant United States Attorney in the Eastern District of Virginia. Prior to joining the Department of Justice, he spent three years as a litigator in private practice: first with Heller Ehrman White & McAuliffe in San Francisco, California, working on complex commercial litigation, including class actions, and then with Covington & Burling in Washington, D.C., handling insurance coverage and antitrust litigation. Prior to practicing, Mr. Brown served as a judicial law clerk for Chief Judge Juan R. Torruella of the U.S. Court of Appeals for the First Circuit.

Since 2005, Mr. Brown has served as a state editor for the ABA's annual survey of state class action law. He also co-authored a chapter on private antitrust recovery actions for the forthcoming 2008 Global Competition Review's Antitrust Review of the Americas. He has been interviewed regarding antitrust class actions by CNBC and various NBC affiliates, and by radio networks including ABC and the AgriBusiness Network.

Mr. Brown is a graduate of Harvard Law School (J.D., *cum laude*, 1997), where he was an editor and executive board member of the Harvard Civil Rights - Civil Liberties Law Review, and the University of Wisconsin - Madison (B.A.in Philosophy, with distinction, Phi Beta Kappa, 1992).

Mr. Brown is admitted to practice in California and the District of Columbia.

Avi S. Garbow

Avi Garbow, a Partner at the Firm, joined Cohen Milstein in 2005 and is a member of the Securities Litigation practice group and Co-Chair of the International Human Rights practice group.

In the securities field, Mr. Garbow focuses his practice on representing both domestic and international investors. Mr. Garbow is currently involved in several major securities fraud actions, including In re Parmalat Securities Litigation (S.D.N.Y.) and In re Converium Holding AG Securities Litigation (S.D.N.Y.), and also provides counsel to the independent fiduciary of the Enron employees stock ownership plans in connection with the Enron federal securities class action.

Prior to joining the Firm, Mr. Garbow was a Junior Partner at Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr in their Securities and Litigation Departments, where he focused on complex civil and criminal litigation, with an emphasis on internal investigations and financial fraud matters. Mr. Garbow also served over ten years in government as a federal prosecutor in the Justice Department's Environmental Crimes Section, a Special Assistant United States Attorney, and a Special Assistant to the Assistant Adminstrator for Enforcement at the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency. Mr. Garbow has also served as an instructor at the Justice Department's National Advocacy Center. He received special commendations from both the Department of Justice and the Environmental Protection Agency for his trial work.

Mr. Garbow serves as Co-Chair of the American Bar Association's International Human Rights Committee. He has also done work on behalf of the Robert F. Kennedy Memorial Center for Human Rights, and serves on the Board of Directors for International Rights Advocates (an international human rights organization) and Urban Ecology Institute (an environmental, and community development organization).

He is a graduate of the University of Virginia School of Law (J.D., 1992) (where he was the recipient of the Robert F. Kennedy Award for Public Service), the University of Virginia Graduate School of Arts and Sciences (M.A. in Marine Affairs, 1994), and the University of Michigan (B.A., magna cum laude, 1988). He is also a former firefighter.

Mr. Garbow is a member of the Virginia and District of Columbia bars.

William P. Butterfield

William Butterfield, a Partner of the firm, is a member of the Antitrust practice group.

For several years, Mr. Butterfield has been leading plaintiffs' discovery efforts in In Re New Motor Vehicles Canadian Export Antitrust Litigation, MDL 1532. He is also working on In Re Hydrogen Peroxide Antitrust Litigation, (E.D. Pa.), In Re OSB Antitrust Litigation, (E.D. Pa.), and In Re Methyl Methacrylate (MMA) Antitrust Litigation, (E.D. Pa.).



Previously, Mr. Butterfield was one of the principal attorneys involved in nationwide litigation challenging lending practices conducted by one of the nation's largest sub-prime lenders. In that case, Mr. Butterfield worked extensively with the FTC, and was responsible for generating nationwide media and Congressional attention to lending practices conducted by Associates Finance. Plaintiffs and the FTC eventually settled with Citigroup (which had acquired Associates Finance) for \$240 million (*In Re Citigroup Loan Cases*, J.C.C.P. 4197). Mr. Butterfield was also a principal attorney for the plaintiff classes in *In re Prudential Securities Limited Partnerships Litigation*, MDL No. 1005 (S.D.N.Y.), which settled for \$137 million, and *In re PaineWebber Securities Litigation*, 94 Civ. 8547 (S.D.N.Y.), which settled for \$200 million.

Mr. Butterfield is recognized as a leader in the field of electronic discovery. He has developed electronic document management solutions since the early 1990s, when he helped design and led the implementation of an electronic document repository to manage more than 15 million pages of documents produced in *In re Prudential Securities Limited Partnerships Litigation*, MDL No. 1005 (S.D.N.Y.). That system was recognized by Senior U.S. District Judge Milton Pollack as one of the most innovative and sophisticated high-tech document management/litigation support systems available "163 F.R.D. 200, 208 (S.D.N.Y. 1995). In 2005, Mr. Butterfield testified before the U.S. Judicial Conference Rules Committee regarding proposed electronic discovery amendments to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. He speaks at conferences internationally on electronic discovery issues. Mr. Butterfield is also a member of The Sedona Conference, a nonprofit research and educational institute dedicated to the advanced study of law and policy. His comments appeared recently in an article entitled, "E-Discovery: Business is Booming and Lawyers are getting in on the Trend." *Lawyers Weekly*, March 14, 2006.

Mr. Butterfield has also served as an adjunct professor at American University, Washington College of Law, where he taught a course in commodities law and regulation.

Before joining CMHT, Mr. Butterfield was a partner at Finkelstein, Thompson & Loughran, where he focused on antitrust, securities, consumer and banking litigation. While at FT&L, he also served extensively as outside counsel for federal banking agencies, where he investigated and litigated claims in connection with failed financial institutions. Mr. Butterfield has also defended individuals and companies in federal courts and administrative tribunals in matters involving securities and commodities fraud, insider trading, takeover litigation, broker-dealer violations and registration issues. He began his legal career as an assistant prosecuting attorney for Montgomery County, Ohio.

Mr. Butterfield graduated from the University of Toledo, College of Law in 1978, and earned his undergraduate degree from Bowling Green State University in 1975.

Mr. Butterfield is admitted to practice in the District of Columbia and is an inactive member of the Ohio bar.

Carol V. Gilden



Carol Gilden, a Partner at Cohen Milstein, is a member of the Securities Fraud/Investor Protection practice group. She is the resident Partner at the Firm's Chicago office.

Prior to joining Cohen Milstein, Ms. Gilden served as the head of Much Shelist's securities class action practice and as the Firm's Vice Chair of the Class Action Department. She also worked as an enforcement attorney with the Midwest Regional Office of the Securities and Exchange Commission.

Ms. Gilden has served as co-lead counsel in the Sears/Sears Acceptance Corp. Securities Litigation, Sara Lee Securities Litigation, 99 Cents Only Stores Securities Litigation, Quokka Sports Securities Litigation and the City of Chicago's case against on-line travel providers. Ms. Gilden also served on the Executive Committees of the Global Crossing Securities Litigation (settlements of \$443 million, litigation continues) and the Merrill Lynch & Co. Research Reports cases (\$125 million settlement in principle). Among other notable cases, Ms. Gilden served as co-lead counsel in the ML Lee Securities Litigation and Smith Kline Litigation which settled for \$33 million and \$30 million respectively, as well as lead counsel in *Pacha et. al. v. McKesson Corporation, et.al.*, a private action which settled for a confidential sum, and as liaison counsel and a litigation team member in the Waste Management Litigation, which settled for \$220 million. Under her leadership, the firm also served as active members of the litigation teams in the *AOL Time Warner Securities Litigation* (\$2.5 billion settlement) and *Salomon Analyst Litigation/In re AT&T* (\$75 million settlement).

In addition to her work on behalf of clients, Ms. Gilden publishes scholarly articles and course materials, and lectures at key industry conferences and seminars. She is an author and co-author of articles published by the National Law Journal, Courts Grapple with Lead-Counsel Auctions; IICLE on Illinois Causes of Action, Shareholder Derivative Suits; the American Bar Association, The Impact of Central Bank on Securities Fraud Litigation: The Plaintiffs' Perspective; Illinois Bar Journal, Proposed Rule 225: A Death Warrant for Class Actions in Illinois and Practising Law Institute on Class Actions Litigation: Prosecution and Defense Strategies A Hybrid 23(B)(2) Rule For Hybrid Class Actions? New Developments In The Use Of Rule 23(B)(2) In Class Certification. In January 2005, Ms. Gilden testified against Proposed Rule 225 before the Illinois Supreme Court's Rules Committee.

Ms. Gilden is a regular presenter at conferences and seminars around the country and has spoken at seminars sponsored by the American Bar Association, Chicago Bar Association, Practising Law Institute, Illinois CPA Foundation, Hines Insurance Symposium, the Ohio and Wisconsin Bar Associations, and the National Association of Shareholders and Consumer Attorneys, as well as at other symposiums.

Ms. Gilden was selected as an "Illinois Super Lawyer" in 2005, 2006 and 2007 by Law & Politics, which published its selections in Chicago magazine (May 2005, February 2006 and February 2007 issues). Only 5 percent of Illinois attorneys are awarded this honor.

Ms. Gilden also is a frequent commentator in the national media on various class action topics. She frequently appears on CNBC, including on a special segment titled *I Want My Money Back*, where she was described as "one of the top investor advocacy attorneys in the country." She also



has been featured on the ABC news programs *World News Tonight*, *World News Now* and *Good Morning America*, as well as has made multiple appearances on *First Business Morning News*. Ms. Gilden recently appeared on the cover of *Chicago Lawyer* in connection with a feature article on The Ebb and Flow of Securities Class Actions.

Ms. Gilden is the President of the National Association of Shareholder and Consumer Attorneys (NASCAT), which is the preeminent trade association for securities class action attorneys, and serves on its Executive Committee. Prior to becoming President, she first served as Treasurer, then President-Elect for NASCAT. Ms. Gilden is the first woman in NASCAT's 18-year history to be elected Treasurer, President-Elect and subsequently, President. Ms. Gilden is also Vice President of the Institute for Law and Economic Policy (ILEP). She also was a member of Illinois Attorney General Lisa Madigan's Prescription Drug Transition Working Group. Ms. Gilden is a member of the American Bar Association, Illinois State Bar Association, Chicago Bar Association and the Association of Securities and Exchange Commission Alumni.

Ms. Gilden is a graduate of the University of Illinois (B.S., Business Administration, 1979). She graduated from Chicago-Kent College of Law (J.D., *with honors*, 1983) where she was a member of the Chicago-Kent Law Review.

Ms. Gilden is admitted to practice in Illinois, the federal district court for the Northern District of Illinois and the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Seventh Circuit.

Robert G. Eisler

Robert Eisler, a Partner at Cohen Milstein, joined the Firm in 2007 and is a member of the Antitrust practice group. He is the resident partner in the New York office. Prior to joining Cohen Milstein, Mr. Eisler was a partner at Lieff Cabraser Heimann and Bernstein.

Mr. Eisler has extensive experience in complex litigation at the trial and appellate levels, particularly in the prosecution of antitrust class actions. He has served as lead or co lead counsel in many cases in the state and federal courts, including In re Buspirone Antitrust Litigation, (\$90 million settlement), In re Oxycontin Antitrust Litigation, and In re Ciprofloxacin Hydrochloride Antitrust Litigation. Mr. Eisler is currently involved in the prosecution of numerous major antitrust actions throughout the United States.

Mr. Eisler is a 1986 graduate of LaSalle University, and a 1989 graduate of Villanova Law School.

He is admitted to practice in New York and Pennsylvania.

Michael P. Lehmann

Michael P. Lehmann has joined Cohen Milstein as a partner and will head our new San Francisco office. Mr. Lehmann brings to the firm 29 years of experience as a business litigator, with a practice that ranged from class action litigation to business litigation on behalf of individual clients to extensive regulatory work before federal, state and international bodies to domestic and international arbitration.



Prior to joining Cohen Milstein, Mr. Lehmann had worked since graduating from law school at what became Furth Lehmann LLP, where he eventually served as Managing Partner and in recent years has served as lead counsel for direct or indirect purchaser classes in numerous antitrust cases.

Lynda J. Grant

Lynda J. Grant joined Cohen Milstein in 2007 as a Partner in our New York office, and will concentrate her efforts in the securities practice area.

Ms. Grant is an accomplished lawyer with over 20 years of experience at Labaton Sucharow representing shareholders and limited partners. Throughout this time, her practice has consisted of class and derivative actions, ranging from large securities fraud cases to those seeking to enjoin unfair buy outs, acquisitions and mergers. Ms. Grant has also represented employees and pensioners in ERISA class actions. Her clients have included individual shareholders and limited partners, sophisticated hedge fund managers, major state, local and city pension funds, and union funds.

Ms. Grant's early career centered on representing limited partners and REIT holders in highprofile matters. In that capacity, she acted as Lead or Co-Lead Counsel in such cases as: The Gillette Family Trust v. Insignia Financial Group, Inc., Inc. et al. (the "Shelter Properties" Action); Warren Heller v. McNeil Partners, L.P., et al.; Irving Zakin v. William Dockser, et al. (the "CRITEF" Action): Joan King v. Oxford Tax Exempt Fund II Corporation, and William Wallace v. Devon Associates, et al. (the "Growth Hotel Investors" Action); and Carlstrom v. Arvida/JMB Managers, Inc., (in which she helped to obtain a preliminary injunction after trial, which stopped a \$160 million defensive recapitalization). She also commenced the action, In Re Estate Associates Limited Partnership Litigation, which eventually resulted in a \$184 million jury verdict. Subsequently, Ms. Grant was part of a team which successfully tried the action Gelfman, et al. v. Weeden Investors, L.P., and helped obtain an injunction in the action In re MONY Group Inc. Shareholder Lit., temporarily stopping the \$1.5 billion buyout of MONY Insurance Co. by AXA Financial. Ms. Grant also successfully tried the books and records action captioned Forsythe, et al. v. CIBC Employee Private Equity Fund (U.S.) L.P. et al.

More recently, she was instrumental in obtaining a \$67.5 million settlement for the class in *In re St. Paul Securities Litigation*, was part of a team which settled the action *In re DHB Industries, Inc. Class Action Litigation*, for \$40 million and significant corporate governance reforms, and obtained an \$8 million settlement in *In re Van der Moolen Securities Litigation*. She was one of the Lead Counsel in the action *In re Marsh ERISA Litigation*, and *In re St. Paul Travelers Sec. Litig. II*, and numerous other actions.

Ms. Grant is a member of the American Bar Association, and serves as a co-chairperson of the Class and Derivative subcommittee on securities litigation. Her article "CAFA: Is the Remedy Worse than the Illness?" was published in the *ABA Class and Derivative Action* newsletter. She is also a regular speaker on securities and class action related topics, having recently served as a panelist on the ABA program entitled Class Certification: Looking Beyond the Pleadings, and at the ABA Annual Convention in 2006, on the panel entitled, "It's a Small World After All: The Increasing Influence of Foreign and Multinational Class Actions." Late last year, she also spoke

Case 1:07-cv-07183-DC Document 15-3 Filed 10/19/2

Filed 10/19/2007 Page 13 of 18



at a conference in Sydney, Australia regarding the international reach of the federal securities laws. Recently she moderated an ABA Panel concerning the impact of the IPO decision, and was a panelist for a telephone presentation regarding the extraterritorial effect of the federal securities laws. Given her vast experience in representing investors, Ms. Grant has earned the distinction of being named as one of the top female attorneys in the corporate governance area.

Ms. Grant received a J.D. from Cornell University Law School, and is admitted to practice in New York, and the United States District Courts for the Southern and Eastern Districts of New York.



Attorney Profiles - Of Counsel & Associates

Sahar F. Aziz

Sahar Aziz, an Associate at Cohen Milstein, joined the Firm in 2007 and is a member of the Civil Rights & Employment practice group.

Ms. Aziz currently is involved in *Dukes v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.* (N.D. Cal.), a class action which has been certified for over 1.6 million current and former female employees of Wal-Mart on complaints of discrimination in pay and promotion; *M.H. Fox, et al. v. Tyson Foods, Inc.*, a class action on behalf of chicken-processing workers who were not paid for the time they spent putting on and taking off their required safety equipment; and *O'Connor v. BASF Corp.*, which alleges a nationwide pattern of age discrimination in layoffs from BASF, a major chemical company based in Germany, with North American headquarters in New Jersey. Ms. Aziz is also involved in a mediation involving a group of female employees alleging a pattern and practice of discrimination in pay and promotion. Ms. Aziz represents pro bono an asylum seeker from Afghanistan.

Prior to joining the Firm, Ms. Aziz was an Associate at Wilmer, Cutler, Pickering, Hale & Dorr LLP in the Securities and Litigation Departments. At WilmerHale, Ms. Aziz worked on white collar crime investigations, securities litigation, and an international human rights case. Prior to joining WilmerHale, Ms. Aziz clerked for the Honorable Andre M. Davis on the United States District Court for the District of Maryland.

Ms. Aziz graduated from the University of Texas at Arlington (B.S. in Management Information Systems, magna cum laude, 1997), the University of Texas Graduate School College of Liberal Arts (M.A. in Middle Eastern Studies, 2004), and the University of Texas School of Law (J.D., cum laude, 2004). At the University of Texas School of Law, Ms. Aziz served as an Associate Editor on the Texas Law Review, participated in the Immigration Clinic, and organized an academic conference entitled "Islam and the Law: The Question of Sexism." She authored two Notes, The Laws on Providing Material Support to Terrorist Organizations: The Erosion of Constitutional Rights or a Legitimate Tool for Preventing Terrorism?, 9 Tex. J. on C.L. & C.R. 45 (Winter 2003), and Linking Intellectual Property Rights in Developing Countries with Research and Development, Technology Transfer, and Foreign Direct Investment Policy: A Case Study of Egypt's Pharmaceutical Industry, 10 ILSA J Int'l & Comp L 1 (Fall 2003). While in law school, Ms. Aziz interned at the American Civil Liberties Union of Texas where she conducted community outreach regarding post September 11 civil rights and national security issues. Ms. Aziz also interned at the Commercial Law Development Program at the United States Department of Commerce where she focused on international development projects in Egypt.

Ms. Aziz is a member of the National Employment Lawyers Association. Ms. Aziz is fluent in Arabic and proficient in Spanish.

Ms. Aziz is admitted to practice in Texas and the District of Columbia.

R. Joseph Barton



Joseph Barton joined Cohen, Milstein, Hausfeld & Toll P.L.L.C. as an associate in 2001 and is a member of the Antitrust, Securities and Employee Benefits practice groups. Prior to joining the firm, Mr. Barton served as a judicial law clerk to the Honorable Lenore C. Nesbitt, United States District Judge for Southern District of Florida (2000-2001). Since joining the firm, Mr. Barton has been actively involved in a diverse number of class action cases.

Mr. Barton has been actively involved in a number of employee benefit cases. For example, in Beam v. HSBC Bank, No. (W.D.N.Y.) (settlement of \$9.25 Million) which challenged the sale of stock for \$25 million by the family shareholders to the Azon Corporation ESOP, Mr. Barton briefed and argued the motions for summary judgment, resulting in denial of defendants' motions and granting plaintiffs' motion for partial summary judgment. In Simpson v. Fireman's Fund Insurance Company (N.D. Cal.), Mr. Barton represented a class of active and terminated employees alleging that FFIC's policy of terminated persons on disability violated the discrimination provisions of ERISA, and obtained a settlement which included restoring their right to benefits for a period of years and also reimbursement of past expenses. Additionally, Mr. Barton has also been involved in a number of cases alleging breach of fiduciary duty by investing the 401k plan in company stock. Mr. Barton is currently working on a case against certain insiders at Tharaldson Motels who sold stock to the ESOP for \$500 million, Hans v. Gary Tharaldson et al. (D.N.D.) and a case against SBC Communications (now AT&T), Stoffels et al. v. SBC Communications (W.D. Tex.) alleging that their provision and subsequent elimination of cash payments via a program known as Telephone Concession constituted a defined benefit pension plan under ERISA and violated ERISA. At the hearing on the class certification motion, in Stoffels, the Court complimented Mr. Barton on the quality of his advocacy and subsequently certified the class as requested.

Mr. Barton has been active in a number of securities fraud lawsuits including *In re Physician Corporation of America Securities Litigation* (S.D. Fla.) (settlement of \$10.2 million), and *In re MCI Securities Litigation* (D.D.C.) (settlement of \$4.5 million) and also represented a small class of former Sterling shareholders who received Uniroyal stock in a merger in *Avery v. Uniroyal Technology Corp.*, (M.D. Fla.) (settlement of \$2.3 million). Mr. Barton currently represents limited partners of Lipper Convertibles, a now-defunct hedge fund, in a class action arbitration against the former general partners, *Levitt v. Lipper Holdings et al.* (AAA), and also in litigation against the outside auditor in federal district court, *Levitt v. PricewaterhouseCoopers* (S.D.N.Y.) alleging violations of the federal securities laws in connection with their investments in the Partnership which were allegedly overvalued for over 5 years.

Mr. Barton has also worked on a number of antitrust actions. Mr. Barton was a part of the team that engaged in intensive trial preparations in *In re High Fructose Corn Syrup Antitrust Litigation*, (C.D. Ill.) a class action alleging price-fixing by the manufacturers of high fructose corn syrup, which settled for more than \$500 million shortly before trial. Mr. Barton is currently working on *In re Mercedes-Benz Antitrust Litigation* (D.N.J.), a class action alleging price-fixing of new Mercedes -Benz vehicles in the New York Region. In connection with the *Mercedes-Benz* litigation, Mr. Barton briefed and argued and obtained summary judgment on a matter of first impression that established that lessee-plaintiffs had standing to sue as direct purchasers under the federal antitrust laws.

Filed 10/19/2007

Additionally, Mr. Barton considers pro bono activities to be an important part of his practice. Along with the non-profit law firm Midwest Environmental Advocates, Mr. Barton provided pro bono representation to the grassroots citizens action group Clean Water Action Council of Northeastern Wisconsin, in objecting to a settlement by the United States Department of Justice and the State of Wisconsin concerning natural resource damages in the Fox River area of Wisconsin. Mr. Barton also represented a client in D.C. Superior Court against her former employer who refused to pay her wages and overtime, in which the Judge described Mr. Barton's representation as follows: "everything done on behalf of the Plaintiff has been professional, timely and thorough."

Mr. Barton received his undergraduate degree from the College of William & Mary (B.A. 1991) where he majored in History and minored in Classical Studies, and graduated Order of the Coif from the College of William & Mary, Marshall-Wythe School of Law (J.D. 2000). At law school, he received the Lawrence W. I'Anson Award for outstanding student scholarship, character and leadership, the William B. Spong Award for professionalism and ethics, the Robert R. Kaplan Award for excellence in legal writing and Order of the Barristers. He served on the editorial board of the William & Mary Law Review and was a staff member of the William & Mary Bill of Rights Journal. Mr. Barton was a member of the William & Mary National Trial Team and served as Vice-President of the William & Mary Chapter of the Association of Trial Lawyers of America.

Mr. Barton is the author of *Determining the Meaning of "Direct Evidence" in Discrimination* Cases Within the Eleventh Circuit: Why Judge Tjoflat was (W)right, 77 Fla. B.J. 42 (2003), Drowning in a Sea of Contract: Application of the Economic Loss Rule to Fraud and Negligent Misrepresentation Claims, 41 Wm. & Mary L. Rev. 1789 (2000), and Utilizing Statistics and Bellwether Plaintiff Trials: What do the Constitution and the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure Permit?, 8 Wm. & Mary Bill Rts. J. 199 (1999). Each of Mr. Barton's published articles has been cited by both courts and commentators.

Mr. Barton is admitted to practice in the State of California and the District of Columbia and is listed in the Marquis' Who's Who in American Law.

Elizabeth A. Berney

Elizabeth Berney joined the Firm as Of Counsel in 2005 and is a member of the Securities Fraud/Investor Protection practice group. Her work includes securities fraud class actions in federal courts in New York, New Jersey, Florida, Michigan, and California.

Ms. Berney is the co-author of Restoring Investor Trust in Auditing Standards and Accounting Principles, published in the Harvard Journal of Legislation (Winter 2004). She also has written extensive materials for legal seminars and speeches. She served as a guest lecturer for a Cardozo Law School ethics class and a guest lecturer for a Harvard Law School corporations class regarding securities fraud, was a featured speaker and panelist for the Women's National Book Association, and appeared in a German television documentary. She is a member of the Federal Bar Council.

Prior to joining Cohen Milstein, Ms. Berney was an active member of the plaintiffs' legal teams



in leading securities fraud, consumer, and human rights class actions including the Enron and Xerox shareholder litigations, the Ford Explorer/Firestone Tire litigation, and the Holocaust Assets cases. From 2000-2005, Ms. Berney practiced law at another prominent plaintiffs' class action firm. Previously, she worked at Dewey Ballantine in the tax and municipal bonds fields, where she obtained the rulings needed to finance construction of the Intrepid Museum; at Gilbert Segall and Young (now part of Holland & Knight), where she focused on foreign sovereign immunities and general commercial litigation; as in-house counsel for a college; and in her own legal and literary practice, where she negotiated agreements for computer companies and notable authors.

Ms. Berney is an avid amateur violinist. She played violin in the Chicago Civic Orchestra while in law school, and, more recently, has played in COSMOS (the Chamber Orchestra of Science and Medicine). She currently plays first violin in the New York City Bar Association Lawyers' Orchestra.

Ms. Berney is a graduate of Cornell University, where she earned a B.S. in industrial and labor relations with a minor in music (*with honors*, 1975), and the University of Chicago Law School (J.D., 1978).

Ms. Berney is admitted to practice in New York and Pennsylvania.

Mark D. Bogen

Mark Bogen focuses his practice on investor protection and consumer fraud issues.

Mr. Bogen received his law degree in 1983 from Loyola University School of Law in Chicago, Illinois. Prior to law school, he attended the University of Illinois, where he received a B.S.in 1980.

During the past 14 years, Mr. Bogen has written two weekly legal columns for the Sun-Sentinel newspaper located in Ft. Lauderdale, Florida. The Sun-Sentinel is a Tribune Company owned newspaper. Mr. Bogen, who is a former adjunct professor of business law, was also a legal correspondent for the local NBC affiliate in Palm Beach, Florida.

Mr. Bogen is admitted to practice law in the State of Florida and Illinois.

Andrew B. Bullion

Andrew Bullion joined Cohen Milstein as an Associate in February 2006 and is a member of the firm's Antitrust and International practice groups. He has extensive complex litigation experience on both the plaintiff and defense sides. Prior to joining the firm, Mr. Bullion spent several years as a litigator in private practice in Philadelphia, handling complex commercial matters, including class actions, as well as tort law and intellectual property matters.

He is currently working on several national and international antitrust actions, including: *In re Air Cargo Shipping Services Antitrust Litigation* (E.D.N.Y.), alleging price-fixing of rates for airfreight shipping services by dozens of major international flagship airlines; and the *In re Air*

Passenger Antitrust Litigation (N.D.Ca.), alleging price-fixing by British Airways and Virgin Atlantic airlines of surcharges added to the price of passenger tickets for long-haul flights.

Mr. Bullion is a graduate of Villanova University School of Law (J.D. 1996) and Villanova University (B.A. 1989). During law school he clerked for the Federal Trade Commission's Bureau of Competition, and with Advokatfirman Vinge KB, Sweden's largest law firm.

Mr. Bullion is admitted to practice in Pennsylvania, New Jersey, and the District of Columbia.

S. Douglas Bunch

Doug Bunch, an Associate at the Firm, joined Cohen Milstein in 2006 and is a member of the Securities practice group.

Mr. Bunch is currently working on several active securities fraud actions against issuers of securities for allegedly misleading investors, including *In re Pozen Securities Litigation* (M.D.N.C.), *Blatt v. Corn Products International, Inc.* (N.D. Ill.), and *Levitt v. PricewaterhouseCoopers, LLP* (S.D.N.Y.).

Mr. Bunch is a graduate of the William & Mary School of Law (2006), where he was a recipient of the Benjamin Rush Medal. A member of Phi Beta Kappa, he graduated *summa cum laude* from the College of William & Mary in 2002 with a Bachelor's degree in Government and Classical Studies. Mr. Bunch is also a 2003 graduate of Harvard University's Graduate School of Education, from which he holds a Master's degree in Administration, Planning, and Social Policy. At Harvard, he served as an intern in the Boston office of the U.S. Department of Education's Office for Civil Rights, where he worked closely with attorneys to enforce federal laws that protect students from discrimination on the basis of race, gender, age, and disability.

Mr. Bunch is actively involved in several nonprofit endeavors. He serves as Chairman of Global Playground, Inc., an organization which promotes education in developing countries; as Executive Director of Ascanius: The Youth Classics Institute, which promotes the study of classics in the elementary school; and as a member of the Board of Directors of the Northeast Conference on the Teaching of Foreign Languages, which promotes the study of world languages more broadly.

Mr. Bunch is admitted to practice in New York and his admission is pending in the District of Columbia.

Whitney R. Case

Whitney R. Case joined Cohen Milstein as an Associate in 2005 and is a member of the Employee Benefits and Consumer Protection practice groups.

Ms. Case has been actively involved in a number of class action employee benefit cases, including a case against SBC Communications, Inc., which alleges widespread miscalculation of pension benefits owed to their employees in violation of ERISA. Ms. Case also represents Tharaldson Motels, Inc. Employee Stock Ownership Plan in an action for breach of fiduciary duties against the Trustee and other fiduciaries. In addition, Ms. Case is involved in a case